HISTORIC AREA COMMISSION New Castle Town Hall 2nd and Delaware Streets October 15, 2009

Present: Sally Monigle, Chairman

Doug Heckrotte Bill Hentkowski Robin Hegvik David Bird

City Personnel: Jeff Bergstrom, Inspection Department

Mrs. Monigle called the meeting to order at 5:10 p.m. Roll call followed.

OLD APPLICATIONS

M. Lenhoff, 318 Delaware Street

Replace concrete sidewalk on Delaware Street and on 4th Street (Birdgewater's). Discussion: Ms. Lenhoff is still concerned with the safety of her customers; particularly with installing brick rather than concrete as was ruled at last month's HAC meeting. The concrete has been there over 100 years. The cost is over double from the cost to install concrete. (She cited other properties in the City that have concrete sidewalks in the historic district.) She would like to clean up the entire area around the store but she will settle for the area immediately in front of their business that their customers use most. Her contractor proposed using an exposed aggregate containing a tint that will make the sidewalk look older. He further stated it will match the building better than brick. (Discussion with breaking precedent followed.)
Ms. Monigle feels that there are certain cases that this body should be deal with on an individual basis and that this body should be able to defend its decision. She supports what the applicant wants to do and added that it would be more consistent with the entire block as it currently exists. Mr. Heckrotte does not agree with Ms. Monigle's rationale.

(Discussion followed about installing a replacement brick that might be safer and repairs to utilities that will disrupt the bricks.) It is the City's position that property owners are responsible for sidewalks on their property. Ms. Monigle offered that this City is home to a variety of building styles and we are not attempting to make everything one period style. (Further discussion about materials and cost was heard.)

Action: Mr. Heckrotte made a motion to vote on the application as submitted. Mr. Bird seconded the motion.

Mr. Bird voted not to allow the applicant to install concrete and to uphold the decision this body made in September 2009. Aesthetically it should be brick and we would be setting precedent in residential and commercial areas. He also feels that the burden of sidewalks should not be totally that of the

Historic Area Commission Minutes October 15, 2009 Page 2

landowner. Concerning safety it should be concrete base with brick on it. Ms. Hegvik voted to approve concrete in the front (Delaware Street) but the side does not need to be done at this time and prefers brick on the side to go along with brick that is on the street.

Ms. Monigle voted in favor of allowing the applicant to install concrete.

Mr. Heckrotte voted not to allow the applicant to install concrete.

Mr. Hentkowski voted not to allow the applicant to install concrete.

Disposition: The motion was defeated.

(Note: Ms. Lenhoff inquired about her options going forward and was advised she can take the matter to the Board of Adjustment.)

NEW APPLICATIONS

M. Hayward, 49 West 5th Street

Install crush and run driveway in back yard off alley.

Discussion: The driveway is not visible from 5th Street. The homeowner has already planted two (2) large trees to block her vehicle. The alleyway behind her property is unpaved. The contractor can go 10 feet into the alley with the crush and run; however, the alley is a public alley and outside the purview of HAC. The applicant was advised to speak with Mr. Bergstrom about spreading crush and run into the public alley.

Action: Mr. Heckrotte made a motion to vote on the application as submitted.

Mr. Bird seconded the motion.

Disposition: Approved by unanimous vote.

G. Burns, 6 West 5th Street

Remove existing window at patio and replace with wood door. Remove existing door and close opening with matching brick. Replace rear kitchen window.

Discussion: HAC members viewed photographs of the proposed work.

Action: Mr. Heckrotte made a motion to vote on the application as submitted with the proviso that the litany be followed meaning using wood. Mr. Bird seconded the motion.

Disposition: Approved by unanimous vote.

M. Pavonne, 158 East 2nd Street

Replace 6 front windows with Marvin all-wood windows.

Discussion: Mr. Heckrotte spoke about how the first floor windows glass panes are square and the window trim doesn't match the second floor. The second floor looks correct but the first floor looks odd, but the entire sash is replacement sash.

Mr. Mekulski, Ms. Pavonne's contractor, stated they are flexible with sash size dimension. The contractor said they will install a Marvin unit, pulling the frame and leaving the existing trim. Windows would be ordered with standard brick mold which would be removed. They will pull the casing out from the inside and leave the

Historic Area Commission Minutes October 15, 2009 Page 3

exterior trim intact and reinstall the new units with the new sills and try to salvage the trim. The applicant wishes to start work on this project because the government is offering an attractive rebate on EnergyStar products, including installation, to the end of this year. (Lengthy discussion followed about the type of windows to be ordered.) Mr. Hentkowski would like to look at the windows and get dimensions.

Action: Mr. Heckrotte made a motion to vote on the application as submitted with the proviso that the litany be following meaning wood and that Mr. Hentkowski be afforded time to look at the structure and get some dimensions. Mr. Bird seconded the motion. **Mr. Hentkowski was to visit directly after this meeting.

Disposition: Approved by unanimous vote.

B. Ruf, 157 East 2nd Street

Replace 6 windows on front and right side.

Discussion: Mr. Mekulski is the contractor for Ms. Ruf. Window dimensions were discussed.

Action: Mr. Heckrotte made a motion to vote on the application as submitted with the proviso that the litany be followed meaning using wood. Mr. Bird seconded the motion.

Disposition: Approved by unanimous vote.

A. Gambacorta, 112 East 4th Street

Replace window trim on 8 windows on alley side in kind.

Action: Mr. Heckrotte made a motion to vote on the application as submitted with the proviso that the litany be followed meaning using wood. Mr. Hentkowski seconded the motion.

Disposition: Approved by unanimous vote.

B. Butcher, 124 East 4th Street

Re-stucco front and right side of foundation.

Action: Mr. Heckrotte made a motion to vote on the application as submitted.

Mr. Bird seconded the motion.

Disposition: Approved by unanimous vote.

S. Watts, 60 West 3rd Street

Install concrete pavers on front steps at front door to make step solid; level brick walking path.

Discussion: Mr. Bergstrom confirmed that the work has been completed. A photograph was circulated for HAC members to view. They were fined a double permit fee, but the nature of the offense did not warrant a citation.

Action: Mr. Heckrotte made a motion to vote on the application as submitted with the proviso that the litany be followed which means antique pavers or brick pavers on the stoop and sidewalk and that they be Glen Gary 52DD or 53, whichever is correct. Mr. Bird seconded the motion.

Disposition: Approved by unanimous vote.

Historic Area Commission Minutes October 15, 2009 Page 4

EMERGENCY REPAIRS

B. Widdoes, 22 East 5th Street

Fix leak on the end of back roof over kitchen.

Action: Mr. Heckrotte made a motion to vote on the application as submitted with the proviso that if the gutters are replaced they will be half-round gutters with round down spouts. Mr. Bird seconded the motion.

Disposition: Approved by unanimous vote.

R. Fleck, 212 Delaware Street

Approval of placement of a direct vent chimney on east wall of house.

Action: Mr. Heckrotte made a motion to vote on the application as submitted.

Mr. Bird seconded the motion.

Disposition: Approved by unanimous vote.

Approval of Minutes – Mr. Bird made a motion to approve the minutes of the August and September meetings. Ms. Hegvik seconded the motion which was adopted by unanimous vote.

NEW BUSINESS

Mr. Jerry Hanby, representing contractor Chuck Feldbaumer, requested a consultation with members of HAC to assist with preparing an estimate for renovation of the Community Progressive Club property located at 116 West 3rd Street. The estimate will be provided to the property owner. Currently the property is unoccupied. A variety of topics were discussed that included the roof, chimney, shutters, gutters (exterior and interior), downspouts, siding, windows, dormers, soffets, types of rot-resistant wood and trees. Concerning the latter, Mr. Hanby was advised to contact Chip Patterson, Chairperson of the Tree Commission. The trees in question are on private property.

OLD BUSINESS

N. Bustamante, 315-317 Harmony Street

Mr. Bergstrom informed HAC members that he told Ms. Bustamante that the chimney on this house must come down. The top 10 foot portion of the brick chimney is in poor condition. It is very large and heavy and will do significant damage if it collapses. (*Lengthy discussion followed.*) HAC members have no problem framing it up and tacking over it for now. Nothing is gained with a fake chimney in place. Mr. Bergstrom will contact Ms. Bustamante with this information.

ADJOURNMENT

It was moved and seconded to adjourn the meeting. The meeting was adjourned at 6:45 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Debbie Turner

Debbie Turner, Stenographer